

Derek Naegle

ENG 2010

Toulmin Schema

Claim-

The DREAM act should be passed into federal law to allow millions of young immigrants from all around the world enjoy the blessings of liberty and equality in the country they've grown up in.

Reasons-

1. Because it will reward deserving young immigrants with the opportunity to receive an education and contribute their talents to the United States and its people.
2. Will allow thousands of immigrants to earn their citizenship by serving in the military for 2 years.
3. Educates more of the US population with the result of lowering crime rates in the US.
4. Will reward youth of "Good Moral Character" to not be punished for a law they didn't choose to commit.

Assumptions-

Assumes immigration is a problem needing a solution.

Assumes DREAMers can be a benefit to society

Assumes that America as a whole will benefit from more capable and diverse workforce

Assumes that young people with various ethnic backgrounds and nationalities will benefit from the DREAM Act

Assumes crimes committed by unauthorized immigrants will be reduced.

Assumes people believe in the American dream.

Assumes audience is unfamiliar with the DREAM Act

Assumes people know an illegal immigrant.

Backing-

- **The DREAM Act is a more realistic solution to deportation:**

"Most Americans support the DREAM Act and think legalization is a much more realistic solution than mass deportation, especially for young people who have grown up in the United States," said Rep. Luis Gutierrez, Illinois Democrat and chairman of the immigration task force for the Congressional Hispanic Caucus. "The President's policy allows our enforcement agents to concentrate on deporting criminals and others we really don't want in our country," he noted. "These are young people brought up in the U.S. who have achieved scholastically and remained crime-free." There are an estimated 12 million illegal immigrants here in the United States. Almost 400,000 people were deported in 2011, a record. To deport that many people requires a lot of time, resources, and money and it is unrealistic that we can drastically reduce that number. Most undocumented immigrants are here to stay and take low-paying jobs the average American doesn't want.

Llorente, Elizabeth. "Mitt Romney's Unofficial Advisor Confident About Immigration Lawsuit." <http://latino.foxnews.com/>. Fox News Network, LLC, 11 Oct 2012. Web. 13 Oct 2012. <<http://latino.foxnews.com/latino/politics/2012/10/11/mississippi-joins-lawsuit-against-obama-program-for-dreamers/>>.

Greenblatt, Alan. "Immigration Debate: Can politicians find a way to curb illegal immigration?." CQ Researcher Online (2010): n.pag. CQ Press. Web. 3 Oct 2012. <<http://library.cqpress.com/cqresearcher/document.php?id=cqresrre2008020100&type=hitlist>>.

Vargas, Jose Antonio. "Not Legal Not Leaving." Time Magazine. 25 2012: 1-9. Web. 15 Oct. 2012. <<http://www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,2117243,00.html>>.

- **The DREAM Act is incentive for people to obey the law**

A major provision of the DREAM Act is to only allow undocumented immigrants with "Good Moral Character" the chance to benefit. The INS defines "Good Moral Character"

with a checklist of things that would prevent someone from being categorized as having good moral character and, therefore, ineligible to become a naturalized citizen. This means people convicted of major crimes (murder, rape, drug trafficking, theft or burglary, prostitution etc.) would be ineligible from applying for and benefitting from the DREAM Act. People with minor convictions within 5 years prior to applying are also barred from applying. Some of these minor convictions include: earning principal income from gambling, smuggling illegal immigrants into the country, and being a habitual drunkard. In other words, criminals will not benefit with the passage of the DREAM Act. This is also an incentive to younger people who have the chance to earn citizenship to stay out of trouble. The DREAM Act will give millions something to strive for. It gives them hope to live the American dream. It's an incentive to try hard and obey the law in order to have productive, successful lives.

"What Is Good Moral Character." www.findlaw.com. FindLaw, a Thomson Reuters business, 15 2012. Web. 3 Oct 2012.

<http://fsnews.findlaw.com/firmsite/attachments/LE6_c_checklist_WhatIsGoodMoralCharacter.pdf>.

- **The current national revision of the DREAM Act does not require states to offer in-state tuition:**

Arizona Senate Candidates Richard Carmona (D) and Jeff Flake (R) both support the passage of the DREAM Act. Flake, like many Republicans, is opposed to a mandate permitting undocumented students to pay in-state tuition rates at publicly funded institutions. The current version of the DREAM Act doesn't have such a mandate. This will not become a drain on public education with the flood of new students into public universities. This means, there won't be an increase in the price of tuition to pay for the cost of offering in-state tuition to thousands of new students nor will it make the government spend more money through subsidies. DREAM Act students could be eligible for student loans, but would be ineligible for Pell Grants meaning they'll have to earn their way through college whether by saving up, working, or through scholarships.

Nevarez, Griselda. "Richard Carmona is building momentum in U.S. Senate race." www.voxxi.com. VOXXI News, 13 Oct 2012. Web. 13 Oct 2012.

<<http://www.voxxi.com/richard-carmona-momentum-senate-race/>>.

- **There are economic benefits from the passage of The DREAM Act:**

A recent study by Maryland Institute for Policy Analysis & Research at the University of Maryland found that the benefits of the DREAM Act in the form of income, sales, and property taxes would outweigh the costs of its passage at the state level. The Maryland bill has a provision to subsidize education and even with these subsidies; the benefits are expected to outweigh the costs. The study also took into account the money saved on incarceration costs. There is expected to be less people in state-funded penitentiaries when you have a more educated population. DREAMers will not be a drain on the government's pocketbook either. Beneficiaries of the DREAM act will actually make the government money through tuition costs and fees at publically funded universities. They will also be valuable employees who, through taxes, will be able to contribute to the government. The Congressional Budget Office in 2010 estimated that passage of the DREAM Act would cut the deficit by \$1.4 billion and increase government revenues by \$2.3 billion over a 10-year period. Arne Duncan, the U.S. Secretary of Education, testified to congress in 2011 that by 2018 the United States will have 2.6 job openings for jobs requiring higher education. These jobs are in the fields of science, technology, and engineering, and mathematics.

Leaderman, Daniel. "New study suggests major fiscal benefits of Act." *Southern Maryland Newspapers Online-SoMdNews.com*. Southern Maryland Newspapers, 12 Oct 2012. Web. 13 Oct 2012. <<http://www.somdnews.com/article/20121012/NEWS/710129661/1055/new-study-suggests-major-fiscal-benefits-of-dream-act&template=southernMaryland>>.

Duncan, Arne. United States. U.S. Department of Education. *DREAM Act Testimony*. Washington, D.C.: , 2011. Web. <<http://www.ed.gov/news/speeches/dream-act-testimony>>.

Miranda, Luis. "Get The Facts On The DREAM Act." The White House Blog. www.whitehouse.gov, 01 2010. Web. Web. 15 Oct. 2012. <<http://www.whitehouse.gov/blog/2010/12/01/get-facts-dream-act>>.

- **The United States will benefit as a society, not just DREAMers**

The DREAM Act requires all applicants to either complete 2 years of college or serve 2 years in the military. This will increase the number of enlisted servicemen and provide skills and training that is beneficial to our communities. The DREAM Act will help the Department of Defense achieve its recruiting goals and is part of its Strategic Plan for 2011-2012. By allowing them to get an education we're making an investment in our

country. These talented individuals can contribute their skills, creativity, and knowledge to our society. The sky is the limit for these young people. (Jose Antonio Vargas, an undocumented immigrant from the Philippines is a Pulitzer prize winning journalist.) By giving young immigrants the opportunity to live up to receive an education, we are allowing thousands to be able to find good jobs that will allow them to provide for themselves. The government will not just be adding more people into its welfare program. One of the requirements of the DREAM Act involves what is called "Public Charge". This means that anyone who becomes dependent on government aid over a period of time can become ineligible since the DREAM Act acts as a probationary period of 6 years following application. If someone has a dishonorable discharge from the military this also voids the DREAMer's chance at becoming a documented citizen.

United States. U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 2009. Web.

<<http://www.uscis.gov/portal/site/uscis/menuitem.eb1d4c2a3e5b9ac89243c6a7543f6d1a/?vgnextoid=829b0a5659083210VgnVCM100000082ca60aRCRD&vgnextchannel=829b0a5659083210VgnVCM100000082ca60aRCRD>>.

"dreamact.info." *The DREAM Act Portal*. The DREAM Act Portal, 09 2009. Web. 10 Oct 2012. <<http://dreamact.info/faq/1>>.

Miranda, Luis. "Get The Facts On The DREAM Act." The White House Blog.

www.whitehouse.gov, 01 2010. Web. Web. 15 Oct. 2012.

<<http://www.whitehouse.gov/blog/2010/12/01/get-facts-dream-act>>.

- **DREAMers come from every state and hundreds of countries, and are just as American as we are.**

The stereotypical undocumented immigrant is often portrayed as someone of Mexican heritage living in a border state. The facts are, there are undocumented immigrants in every state who will benefit from the DREAM Act. Most come from all over Latin America and Asia will add to the diversity that we as a country pride ourselves on. They live here with us, they pay taxes like us, but they don't have the same privileges as us.

Greenblatt, Alan. "Immigration Debate: Can politicians find a way to curb illegal immigration?." CQ Researcher Online (2010): n.pag. CQ Press. Web. 3 Oct 2012.

<<http://library.cqpress.com/cqresearcher/document.php?id=cqresrre2008020100&type=hitlist>>.

Vargas, Jose Antonio. "My Life as an Undocumented Immigrant." New York Times [New York, New York] 22 June 2011, Magazine n. pag. Web. 15 Oct. 2012.

<http://www.nytimes.com/2011/06/26/magazine/my-life-as-an-undocumented-immigrant.html?_r=1&pagewanted=all>.

Vargas, Jose Antonio. "Not Legal Not Leaving." Time Magazine. 25 2012: 1-9. Web. 15 Oct. 2012. <<http://www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,2117243,00.html>>.

Conditions of Rebuttal-

- There could be fraud by those who are ineligible for the DREAM Act
- Community colleges will be overrun with the influx of new students.
- Once someone has documents it makes it easier for family members who did come here illegally to get residency and citizenship.
- Incentive for immigrants to bring their children into the United States.
- We should be more focused on securing our borders and keeping people out of our country rather than thinking of ways to accommodate them.
- Undocumented immigrants should be required to apply the same way everyone else does and not be given a grace period or fast-track to gaining residency or citizenship.

Qualifier-

- The path to citizenship is a long journey; the DREAM Act allows the best and brightest undocumented immigrants the chance to contribute to society.
- Investing in educational institutions like community colleges is a good thing. Making an associate's degree a more normal occurrence makes our society as a whole more educated and there are benefits that come from that.
- The DREAM Act will allow candidates between the ages of 2 and 30 to benefit. People entering the country after passage of the DREAM Act will not have the same promise that is being offered to those in that age group.
- Application for citizenship is a long and difficult task to begin with. The DREAM Act will not lessen the requirements to become a naturalized citizen.

- While securing our borders is important, not only because of the entry of undocumented workers here for honest work, it also is important to solve the problem of what to do with all undocumented immigrants who are already here. The government can focus their attention on those who could cause us harm or who are breaking more severe laws rather than on individuals with good character.